

Columbia Community Foundation  
Executive Council 4-25-2012 Meeting Minutes

Meeting called to order by President Ron Krisko at 6:37 PM.

Members Present: John Brocklehurst, Jack Callaghan, Don Hagen, Deborah Hitchcock, Ron Krisko, Dennis Ross, Patty Rolko.

Members Absent: Wayne Brassell, Rita Ross.

1. Scholarship Committee Report.
  - a. Discuss and choose 2012 Columbia Community Foundation Scholarship winners.
    - i. Members reviewed the applicant information and scores.
    - ii. Motion by Dennis Ross to award the two Columbia Community Foundation Scholarships to the two highest scoring applicants (applicant #7 and applicant #3).  
Seconded by Don Hagen.  
Vote: 6 For, 0 Against, 1 Abstain.  
**Motion passed.**
  - b. Discuss and choose 2012 Lucille MacClellan Memorial Scholarship winners.
    - i. Members reviewed the applicant information and scores.
    - ii. Members discussed the scoring results.
      - The second and third place results are very close.
      - Members discussed the rating system as a tool rather than an absolute decision maker.
      - Members discussed that there are currently no foundation guidelines for considering a statistically close score.
    - iii. Motion by Jack Callaghan to award the two Lucille MacClellan Memorial Scholarships to the two highest scoring applicants (applicant #5 and applicant #1).  
Seconded by Patty Rolko  
Vote: 6 For, 0 Against, 1 Abstain.  
**Motion passed.**
  - c. Discuss and approve 2012 Columbia Chamber of Commerce Scholarship winner.
    - i. Members reviewed the applicant information and scores.
    - ii. Motion by Dennis Ross to award the Columbia Chamber of Commerce Scholarship to the highest scoring applicant (applicant #2).  
Seconded by Don Hagen.  
Vote: 6 For, 0 Against, 1 Abstain.  
**Motion passed.**
  - d. Discuss various scholarship statistics gathered.
    - i. Discussion regarding low response rate for the Columbia Chamber of Commerce Scholarship.
      - The question regarding being a Junior Ambassador may be misleading potential applicants to thinking that they are not eligible.
    - ii. Discussion regarding weights of the various scholarship essay components.
      - GPA is currently not included in the scoring.
        - Members inquired why it is requested if it isn't used for scoring.
        - Members considered including this factor in the scoring for the future.
        - Applicants are still confused by what "non-weighted GPA" refers to.
          - It was suggested to add the verbiage "This number should not exceed 4.0" in order to further clarify this requirement.
      - The extracurricular activities, personal statement, and essay question have different weights and do not account equally when determining the overall score.
    - iii. Discussion regarding close and "statistically tied" scores.
      - An inquiry was made as to how much scores would need to change to actually result in two almost tied scores to be actually tied.
        - This is difficult to say because to the different weighted ratings.

- A suggestion was made that if any lower scores are within .05 of a winning score, the board may consider reviewing the applicants more closely and potentially choose another or alternate winner given that the scores are “virtually tied”.
- iv. Members discussed when to reveal the names of the applicants.
  - Members agreed that revealing them at the time of selecting the winners removes the anonymity from the process.
  - The only way to select different qualifying and deserving applicants for each scholarship would be to reveal the names when making the selection, which defeats the purpose of the blind rating system.
- v. Discussions and suggestions will be considered when reviewing the scholarship applications and the rating policy and procedure for next year.

Motion by Dennis Ross to adjourn.

Seconded by Jack Callaghan.

Vote: 6 For, 0 Against, 0 Abstain.

**Meeting adjourned at 7:09 PM.**

**The next board meeting is scheduled for Wednesday May 9 at 6:30 PM at Columbia Town Hall.**

**Minutes approved 5/9/12.**